

## **Comment 1 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Peter  
Last Name: Dorian  
Email Address: peterjdorian@yahoo.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Fireplace burn rules  
Comment:

To Whom this concerns: I recommend that all wood or cellulose burning in fireplaces in the San Joaquin Valley be illegal. Only natural gas or propane type gas be allowed. Several months of the year our air is extremely polluted. Fireplace use is "entertainment" not a necessity. Designating certain burn days is impossible to monitor. "Burn if your registered" is assuming that others that are not "registered will follow the rules. Well, why do I smell smoke all evening long on those "registered" days. Just like having 'no smoking' areas in bars and restaurants is ridiculous so is part time burning of wood or pellets. We know that fireplace burning creates 2.5pm and that is very harmful to our health. The local Air board must feel citizens "right" to burn is more important than our health. Fireplace burning is one area that can be completely controlled by laws. Lets put health FIRST not ideology or politics. Thanks  
Peter Dorian

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2018-12-24 19:28:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Ned  
Last Name: Leiba  
Email Address: ned@leibacpa.com  
Affiliation: CAC SJVAPCD

Subject: Comment on 2018 PM2.5 SIT re San Joaquin Valley  
Comment:

Please see my letter attached.

Thank you.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/4-sjvsip2018-UT9RO1ULVWoEZwJ2.pdf'

Original File Name: NL letter CARB PM2.5.QED.w attach.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-18 16:30:07

No Duplicates.

**Comment 3 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Gene

Last Name: Bigler

Email Address: gbigler@puentesca.org

Affiliation: PUENTES-Bridging Sustainable Communities

Subject: Support for Ned Leiba letter on PM2.5 plan

Comment:

PUENTES has already engaged in partnerships with SUSD, SJCOE, the Port of Stockton, Ten Space Development and the SJC Fairgrounds to plant more than 1500 trees and involve a great part of the Stockton community in revival of our distressed and inadequate tree canopy. We are also developing a tree nursery and seeking support for a new campaign together with the Housing Authority, STAND, SUSD and SJ Delta College to mobilize community support for urban forestry in some of the most environmentally impacted neighborhoods of our community. Working with our neighbors in the Boggs Tract community where our farm is located, we have begun to recognize that we can create more wholesome living conditions for our families by concerted action, especially when public authorities recognize and support the grassroots efforts of our citizens. We implore your action to help us recover a healthful environment through the restoration of our tree canopy.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/5-sjvsip2018-AWYGclYyAzVROVI3.pdf'

Original File Name: Greener\_Healthier\_Stockton.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-21 13:52:55

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: James

Last Name: Enstrom

Email Address: jenstrom@ucla.edu

Affiliation: UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute

Subject: Evidence Invalidating EPA PM2.5 NAAQS and SJV PM2.5 SIP

Comment:

Subject: Evidence Invalidating EPA PM2.5 NAAQS and SJV PM2.5 SIP

Please consider my attached 73-page September 14, 2018 SJVAPCD comment regarding the 2018 PM2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley. My comment contains strong evidence that invalidates the 1997 and 2012 EPA PM2.5 NAAQS, as well as proposed new PM2.5 regulations. There should be no additional PM2.5 regulations in the San Joaquin Valley based on my evidence, which I have presented to EPA.

This comment was previously submitted to sjvsipsupplement. If I do not receive a response from at least one CARB member, then I will assume that my comment has not been read or considered by any CARB member.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/6-sjvsip2018-Wz5WPIQmByBSJgZp.pdf'

Original File Name: Enstrom Comment re SJVAPCD 2018 Plan for PM2.5 091418.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-21 21:54:32

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: James

Last Name: Enstrom

Email Address: jenstrom@ucla.edu

Affiliation: UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute

Subject: Evidence re SJV PM2.5 SIP Showing NO PM2.5 Deaths in CA and US

Comment:

Subject: Evidence re SJV PM2.5 SIP Showing NO PM2.5 Deaths in CA and US

Please read my October 1, 2018 attachment "Recent PM2.5 Activities Documenting NO Relationship Between PM2.5 and Total Mortality in US." I provide weblinks to overwhelming evidence of NO relationship between PM2.5 and total mortality in California and the US. This evidence challenges the scientific and economic validity of the EPA PM2.5 NAAQS and challenges the validity of the SJVAPCD 2018 PM2.5 SIP.

This comment was previously submitted to sjvsipsupplement. If I do not receive a response from at least one CARB member, then I will assume that my comment has not been read or considered by any CARB member.

Attachment: '[www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/7-sjvsip2018-VycAa1dkB3pWZQNc.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/7-sjvsip2018-VycAa1dkB3pWZQNc.pdf)'

Original File Name: PM2.5 Working Group Enstrom Evidence NO PM2.5 Deaths 100118.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-21 22:16:28

No Duplicates.

**Comment 6 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Jim  
Last Name: Ferrari  
Email Address: director@sjfb.org  
Affiliation: San Joaquin Farm Bureau Federation

Subject: PM2.5 Plan Recommendation  
Comment:

Please see attached letter for recommendation from the San Joaquin Farm Bureau Federation.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/8-sjvsip2018-ViZTOAEyUy4CMQFe.pdf'

Original File Name: PM2.5 Plan Recommendation letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-22 14:36:01

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Noelle

Last Name: Cremers

Email Address: ncremers@cfbf.com

Affiliation: California Farm Bureau Federation

Subject: 2018 PM 2.5 and 2016 Moderate Plan State Implementation Plans for the San Joaquin Valley

Comment:

Please see attached comments.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/9-sjvsip2018-AnJWPVEPWTgELFRh.pdf'

Original File Name: PM 2.5 SIP ARB Comments 1-22-19.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-22 15:18:24

No Duplicates.

**Comment 8 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Thomas

Last Name: Menz

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation:

Subject: sjvsip2018

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/12-sjvsip2018-WjdQM10yVH0LI1Mj.pdf'

Original File Name: Menz.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-22 16:00:33

No Duplicates.



**Comment 9 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Genevieve

Last Name: Gale

Email Address: genevieve@calcleanair.org

Affiliation: Central Valley Air Quality Coalition

Subject: CVAQ Comments on San Joaquin Valley Integrated PM2.5 Plan

Comment:

Please see attachment.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/13-sjvsip2018-AGYBblc4AzECaAIW.pdf'

Original File Name: Final PM2.5 Comment - January 2019.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-22 16:12:23

No Duplicates.

**Comment 10 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Joseph  
Last Name: Cattaneo  
Email Address: jcattaneo@gpi.org  
Affiliation: Glass Packaging Institute (GPI)

Subject: Comments to the SJVACPD 2018 Plan  
Comment:

Attached are comments of the Glass Packaging Institute (GPI), concerning San Joaquin's 2018 Plan for the 1997, 2006, and 2012 PM2.5 Standards.

Regards,

Joe

Joseph J. Cattaneo  
Executive Director  
Glass Packaging Institute (GPI)  
1220 N. Fillmore Street, Suite 400  
Arlington, VA 22201  
703-684-6359  
jcattaneo@gpi.org

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/14-sjvsip2018-UTZTJQBoAg4EYVQ7.pdf'

Original File Name: GPI Comments to CARB - SJVAPCD Plan.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-22 16:10:45

No Duplicates.

**Comment 11 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Genevieve

Last Name: Gale

Email Address: genevieve@calcleanair.org

Affiliation: Central Valley Air Quality Coalition

Subject: Request for Audit of San Joaquin Valley's ERC Bank

Comment:

Please see attachment.

Attachment: 'www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/15-sjvsip2018-BWBSJgZkVmkKaVcj.pdf'

Original File Name: ERCLetter&Report1.9.19.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-22 16:13:51

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 12 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018) - Non-Reg.**

First Name: Laura

Last Name: Rosenberger Haider

Email Address: lauragreen.rosenberger@gmail.com

Affiliation: Fresnans Against Fracking

Subject: sjvsip2018

Comment:

An increase of PM 2.5 is predicted due to the lease of more federal land for oil drilling. Oil pump jacks without carburetors release PM 2.5. dust. Five oil producers in Central Valley created more direct PM2.5 than is produced by all passenger vehicles +light +medium-duty trucks combined, Oil Companies often flare off excess gas producing NOx (from Cherylyn Smith) I feel PM 2.5 linked to concentration difficulties as well problems with circulation to the brain.

Attachment: "

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-22 17:00:11

No Duplicates.

**Comment 1 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Duarte

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: American Lung Association

Subject: Comments on SJV SIP 2018

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/17-sjvsip2018-BWFXJARkUnNQIII3.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/17-sjvsip2018-BWFXJARkUnNQIII3.pdf)

Original File Name: Duarte.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-25 11:35:31

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Genevieve

Last Name: Gale

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: CVAQ

Subject: Comments on San Joaquin Valley Integrated PM2.5 Plan

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/18-sjvsip2018-Wj1XMFU4UWdVfQZ2.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/18-sjvsip2018-Wj1XMFU4UWdVfQZ2.pdf)

Original File Name: Gale.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-25 11:49:44

No Duplicates.

**Comment 3 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Samuel

Last Name: Molina

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: Mi Familia Vota

Subject: Comments on SJV SIP 2018

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/19-sjvsip2018-VDldNFc6WWMFbQdm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/19-sjvsip2018-VDldNFc6WWMFbQdm.pdf)

Original File Name: Molina.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-25 11:50:19

No Duplicates.

**Comment 4 for 2018 PM 2.5 State Implementation Plan for the San Joaquin Valley (sjvsip2018). (At Hearing)**

First Name: Ron

Last Name: Sundergill

Email Address: Non-web submitted comment

Affiliation: National Parks Conservation Association

Subject: Comments on SJV SIP 2018

Comment:

Please see attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/20-sjvsip2018-AWxQM1c4Ag4Exm0d.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/20-sjvsip2018-AWxQM1c4Ag4Exm0d.pdf)

Original File Name: Sundergill Redacted.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2019-01-25 13:49:41

No Duplicates.