

## **Comment 1 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Ross

Last Name: Buckenham

Email Address: rbuckenham@calbioenergy.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Ag Methane

Comment:

On the Non-Energy Emissions slide there are different assumptions on cattle ag methane reductions and the deployment of i) digesters ii) Alt manure management and iii) enteric methane reductions. You also mentioned herd reductions but I don't see that on your slide.

Alt 1 says No Digester capture but Alt 2 3 4 have variously declining uses in digesters, what does No Digester Capture mean in Alt 1,

Also what % of cattle are protected by digesters in each Alt.

Also what cattle herd reductions are assumed?

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-15 09:20:17

No Duplicates.

**Comment 2 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Jeffrey

Last Name: Creque

Email Address: ombcomm@arb.ca.gov

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/3-sp22-modelresults-ws-VTYCZwdvVFgBZFQ7.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/3-sp22-modelresults-ws-VTYCZwdvVFgBZFQ7.pdf)

Original File Name: CCI Comment on CARB NWL Modeling Scenarios (2).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-23 14:21:54

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 3 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Evan  
Last Name: Edgar  
Email Address: [evan@edgarinc.org](mailto:evan@edgarinc.org)  
Affiliation:

Subject: ZEV are not Zero Emissions but are plus 62.52 to 90.64  
Comment:

ZEVs are not Zero Emissions but have a Carbon Intensity of 62 to 90 (gCO<sub>2</sub>e/MJ)

ZEVs are not zero greenhouse gas emission vehicles but have a carbon intensity of 62 to 90 (gCO<sub>2</sub>e/MJ) when combining the energy required to produce electricity to charge the battery and the manufacturing process of the battery. CARB's existing emissions factor, which accounts for the energy required to produce the electricity to charge the battery is 23.39 (gCO<sub>2</sub>e/MJ). The range of emissions from the battery manufacturing alone, assuming a 100,000-mile lifespan, have a carbon intensity of 38.13 - 66.26 (gCO<sub>2</sub>e/MJ) depending on the type of ZEV battery.

AB 32 Climate Change Scoping Plan Statutory Requirements is to Minimize Leakage  
ZEV batteries that are manufactured out of state are increasing non-Californian emissions in other states and countries in the amount of 38.13 - 66.26 (gCO<sub>2</sub>e/MJ) depending on the type of ZEV battery. CARB is picking ZEV as the technology winner while leaking emission out of state.

Environmental Justice for All?  
CARB Should Not Exacerbate Harm to Disproportionately Impacted Communities  
Cobalt is mined by forced child labor in the Democratic Republic of the Congo. Think about the extraordinary volume of water and resources used to mine rare minerals for the car's Battery Electric Vehicle (BEV). Amnesty International has documented serious human rights violations linked to the extraction of the minerals used in lithium-ion batteries. Think about the environmental degradation the BEV car imposes on Mother Earth, outside of California on the people of Africa, China, South America, and first nations people of Canada. The Environmental Justice Advisory Committee should be briefed and provide input on this topic.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/4-sp22-modelresults-ws-VTZRNIAjUGFRCFIo.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/4-sp22-modelresults-ws-VTZRNIAjUGFRCFIo.pdf)

Original File Name: CARB ZEV Modeling AB 32 Scoping Plan Final Draft.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-23 21:11:00

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 4 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Evan  
Last Name: Edgar  
Email Address: [evan@edgarinc.org](mailto:evan@edgarinc.org)  
Affiliation:

Subject: Life Cycle White Paper on Greenhouse Gas Impacts of Electric Vehicle Battery Manufacturing  
Comment:

In summary, the following comments are filed:

- CARB has a statutory requirement to minimize leakage when considering the AB 32 Climate Change Scoping Plan Update and needs to address the carbon intensity of BEV battery manufacturing (Slide 2 of Today's Presentation)
- CARB has a statutory requirement to support cost-effective and flexible compliance when considering the AB 32 Climate Change Scoping Plan Update, where heavy-duty ZEV provides neither. (Slide 2 of Today's Presentation)
- CARB should include BEV Battery Manufacturing Emissions into the LCFS since the core tenets of the LCFS are based on life-cycle analysis.
- When modeling for Transportation Demand for ZEVs and Energy Demand by Fuel Type, the carbon intensity of the BEV batteries should be based on an honest life-cycle analysis referencing the European Studies.
- Modeling the 4 scenarios does not even mention RNG, while keeping diesel use around for decades.
- CARB's Environmental Justice Advisory Committee should be briefed and provide input on the forced child labor in the Democratic Republic of the Congo and review Amnesty International documents on the serious human rights violations linked to the extraction of the minerals used in lithium-ion batteries. The EJAC should consider the extraordinary volume of water and resources used to mine rare minerals for the car's BEV, and the environmental degradation the BEV car imposes on people outside of California on the people of Africa, China, South America, and first nations people of Canada. CARB will be hosting the EJAC on March 30, 2022, where we plan to present this information in more details with references.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/5-sp22-modelresults-ws-WjlQN10uVGULUIMp.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/5-sp22-modelresults-ws-WjlQN10uVGULUIMp.pdf)

Original File Name: CARB ZEV Modeling AB 32 Scoping Plan Final Draft - Board Item March 24 22-5-2 .pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-23 22:50:42

No Duplicates.

**Comment 5 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: William

Last Name: Stewart

Email Address: billstewart@berkeley.edu

Affiliation: University of California Berkeley

Subject: ARB's declining forest carbon stock estimates are only true for USFS reserve forests

Comment:

The attached comment provides details that explain the apparent ARB claim that California's forests are losing carbon, as truly independent data financed by the California Board of Forestry and Fire Protection shows that this condition is only measured on reserved forest lands with no sustainable forest management.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/6-sp22-modelresults-ws-UCdSCwZ0UXYHZA1+.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/6-sp22-modelresults-ws-UCdSCwZ0UXYHZA1+.pdf)

Original File Name: W Stewart NWL Forest comments.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-24 11:29:11

No Duplicates.

**Comment 6 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: John

Last Name: Walker

Email Address: cardiffcove@COX.net

Affiliation:

Subject: Dust from Asia

Comment:

<https://www.livescience.com/58437-gobi-desert-dust-sustains-californias-sierra-nevada.html>

A big part of our particulates come from Asia.

jmw

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-28 19:18:16

No Duplicates.

**Comment 7 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Gilly

Last Name: Lyons

Email Address: glyons@pewtrusts.org

Affiliation: The Pew Charitable Trusts

Subject: Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Update Modeling Results Workshop

Comment:

Hello -

Attached, please find a comment letter from The Pew Charitable Trusts regarding the initial modeling results for the 2022 Scoping Plan Update. Thank you very much.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/8-sp22-modelresults-ws-VydVNI0rWVUHYII9.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/8-sp22-modelresults-ws-VydVNI0rWVUHYII9.pdf)

Original File Name: Pew Comments on SP22 Modeling Results 3.31.22.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-31 13:24:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 8 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Muriel

Last Name: Strand

Email Address: ecoengr@comcast.net

Affiliation: retired Air Resources Engineer

Subject: comments on modeling for 2022 scoping plan

Comment:

please see attached.

(upload failed; trying again.)

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/10-sp22-modelresults-ws-UjEHbgdrAD5SMQVr.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/10-sp22-modelresults-ws-UjEHbgdrAD5SMQVr.pdf)

Original File Name: comments on march scoping scenarios workshop.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-31 14:37:14

No Duplicates.



**Comment 9 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: David  
Last Name: Bezanson  
Email Address: bezanpsy3506@hotmail.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: 2022 SCOPING PLAN March  
Comment:

See attached pdf.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/11-sp22-modelresults-ws-V2VcagAzVzYCd1U2.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/11-sp22-modelresults-ws-V2VcagAzVzYCd1U2.pdf)

Original File Name: 2022SCOPINGPLANMar.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-03-31 18:34:51

No Duplicates.

**Comment 10 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Steve

Last Name: Kloos

Email Address: steven.kloos@aquahydrex.com

Affiliation: AquaHydrex

Subject: California can achieve deeper decarbonization with green hydrogen

Comment:

Comment letter is attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/12-sp22-modelresults-ws-WzpWIV0pVGZRP1Qt.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/12-sp22-modelresults-ws-WzpWIV0pVGZRP1Qt.pdf)

Original File Name: AquaHydrex%20Comments%20on%20Scoping%20Plan%20Scenarios%20-%201%20Apr%202022.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-01 08:45:34

No Duplicates.

**Comment 11 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Rebecca

Last Name: O'Brien

Email Address: rebeccaobrien@tnrenewableenergy.com

Affiliation: True North Renewable Energy

Subject: Scoping Plan should commit to developing infrastructure to meet SLCP goals

Comment:

Please find our comment letter attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/14-sp22-modelresults-ws-BXFSOIYIVmADWIMg.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/14-sp22-modelresults-ws-BXFSOIYIVmADWIMg.pdf)

Original File Name: TNRE Scoping Plan Comments\_4.1.22.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-01 13:30:26

No Duplicates.

**Comment 12 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Amy

Last Name: Mmagu

Email Address: ammagu@newlight.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop

Comment:

Please see attached comments.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/15-sp22-modelresults-ws-BXZTNgRqAiEFagZo.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/15-sp22-modelresults-ws-BXZTNgRqAiEFagZo.pdf)

Original File Name: Scoping Plan Update - Initial Modeling Results Workshop - Newlight Technologies.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-01 15:31:45

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 13 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Gene

Last Name: Nelson

Email Address: government@CGNP.org

Affiliation: Californians for Green Nuclear Power, Inc.

Subject: CGNP's Comments - 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop  
Comment:

Hello, CARB:

Here are CGNP's comments. The package contains 4 pages with CGNP's comments followed by 30 pages of relevant supporting materials.

CGNP looks forward to having careful CARB consideration of this packet. CGNP is particularly concerned about the unprecedented emissions leakage that would occur if the State of California plan to close Diablo Canyon Power Plant in 2025 occurs. Emission-free Diablo Canyon would be replaced in large part by emission-laden Wyoming coal-fired generation. CGNP was alerted to some elements of the State of California plan when CGNP had a tour at CAISO's headquarters on May 20, 2016, more than a month before the secret plan to close Diablo Canyon was unveiled on June 21, 2016.

Sincerely,

Gene Nelson, Ph.D. CGNP Legal Assistant  
Californians for Green Nuclear Power, Inc. (CGNP)  
1375 East Grand Ave Ste 103 #523  
Arroyo Grande, CA 93420-2421  
(805) 363 - 4697 cell  
Government@CGNP.org email  
<http://CGNP.org> website

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/16-sp22-modelresults-ws-BmUHZIE+AyABWFQk.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/16-sp22-modelresults-ws-BmUHZIE+AyABWFQk.pdf)

Original File Name: CGNP Packet for CARB Scoping Plan 04 03 22.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-03 14:37:13

No Duplicates.

**Comment 14 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Sophie

Last Name: Meyer

Email Address: smeyer@formenergy.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Scenarios should explore greater electric sector emissions reductions, multiday storage  
Comment:

Please find our comment letter attached. Thank you.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/17-sp22-modelresults-ws-UzVXPgZ1U21WDwRh.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/17-sp22-modelresults-ws-UzVXPgZ1U21WDwRh.pdf)

Original File Name: Form Energy\_Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-03 22:30:05

No Duplicates.

**Comment 15 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: David  
Last Name: Asti  
Email Address: David.Asti@sce.com  
Affiliation: Southern California Edison

Subject: SCE Comments on Initial Modeling Results Workshop  
Comment:

Hi,

Attached please find our comments on the above-referenced item.  
Should you have any questions, please feel free to call/email.

Thanks,

David

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/18-sp22-modelresults-ws-AXJdOF05Aw8EYQdo.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/18-sp22-modelresults-ws-AXJdOF05Aw8EYQdo.pdf)

Original File Name: SCE\_Comments\_SPU\_IMR\_final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 08:46:35

No Duplicates.

**Comment 16 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Bob

Last Name: Graham

Email Address: BGraham5874@gmail.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Strong Plug In Hybrid Coalition comments

Comment:

Comments on slide 14 in the E3 initial model results presentation.  
See attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/19-sp22-modelresults-ws-AXJWJFwvBTkLYwdg.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/19-sp22-modelresults-ws-AXJWJFwvBTkLYwdg.pdf)

Original File Name: Strong PHEV Coalition letter on Scoping Plan model results workshop April 2022 vF.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 09:22:38

No Duplicates.



**Comment 17 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Eileen

Last Name: Tutt

Email Address: Eileen@CalETC.com

Affiliation: Calif Electric Transportation Coalition

Subject: CalETC comments on scoping plan initial model results

Comment:

Comments on the PATHWAYS presentation. See attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/20-sp22-modelresults-ws-UzBcO1c6WW8Aclc0.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/20-sp22-modelresults-ws-UzBcO1c6WW8Aclc0.pdf)

Original File Name: CalETC letter April 4, 2022 on CARB Scoping Plan workshop on model results VF.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 09:30:38

No Duplicates.

**Comment 18 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Rock  
Last Name: Zieerman  
Email Address: rock@cipa.org  
Affiliation: CIPA

Subject: CIPA CCS Scoping Plan Comments  
Comment:

See attached comments.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/21-sp22-modelresults-ws-B2QBblYnBzUEXQBz.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/21-sp22-modelresults-ws-B2QBblYnBzUEXQBz.pdf)

Original File Name: CIPA SP Scenarios Modeling Results Comments 4-4-22.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 09:53:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 19 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Peter

Last Name: Reinhardt

Email Address: shayla@caliberstrat.com

Affiliation: Charm Industrial

Subject: Charm's Comments to 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop  
Comment:

Please find Charm's comments attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/22-sp22-modelresults-ws-AmFcMIMzACFSOQRb.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/22-sp22-modelresults-ws-AmFcMIMzACFSOQRb.pdf)

Original File Name: Charm 04.04.2024 Comments to Scoping Plan Initial Modeling Results Workshop .pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 09:30:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 20 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Muriel

Last Name: Strand

Email Address: ecoengr@comcast.net

Affiliation:

Subject: postscript to earlier comments.

Comment:

please see attached

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/23-sp22-modelresults-ws-WjdVPFYzVmALYVM6.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/23-sp22-modelresults-ws-WjdVPFYzVmALYVM6.pdf)

Original File Name: modeling product packaging for scenarios.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 10:29:18

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 21 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Rita

Last Name: Keil

Email Address: ritakeil@mltpa.org

Affiliation:

Subject: Climate change considerations for the Eastern Sierra region

Comment:

Thank you for the opportunity to submit comments about the 2022 Scoping Plan Update Initial Modeling Results Workshop. I represent the Mammoth Lakes Trails and Public Access Foundation (MLTPA), a recreation advocacy organization based in the Eastern Sierra.

In CARB's study of the regional social costs of carbon, I would encourage you to look at our region's climate change and vulnerability assessment (<https://resilientca.org/projects/cldf157c-0117-49b3-8056-296ff7bb786c/>). The report analyzes the relationships among the economics, public health, and natural resources of our 17,148 square mile region.

MLTPA looks forward to commenting on the draft 2022 Scoping Plan later this spring.

Thank you,  
Rita Keil

Attachment:

Original File Name:

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 11:13:39

No Duplicates.

**Comment 22 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Erin

Last Name: Rodriguez

Email Address: erodriguez@ucsusa.org

Affiliation:

Subject: UCS comments

Comment:

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/25-sp22-modelresults-ws-UCVWM1clWFQGNAgm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/25-sp22-modelresults-ws-UCVWM1clWFQGNAgm.pdf)

Original File Name: UCS\_4.4\_scoping plan.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 11:37:02

No Duplicates.

**Comment 23 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Mandip

Last Name: Samra

Email Address: msamra@burbankca.gov

Affiliation: City of Burbank

Subject: BWP comments on Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Works  
Comment:

Burbank Water and Power (BWP) is pleased submit the attached  
comments to the Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update - Initial  
Modeling Results Workshop

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/26-sp22-modelresults-ws-VmYFNwY3AGcLPwMx.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/26-sp22-modelresults-ws-VmYFNwY3AGcLPwMx.pdf)

Original File Name: 040422 Scoping Plan Comment Letter - BWP.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 11:45:05

No Duplicates.

**Comment 24 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Anna Bella  
Last Name: Korbatov  
Email Address: annabella@fermataenergy.com  
Affiliation: Fermata Energy

Subject: Fermata Energy's Comments on CARB's March 15 workshop on the Initial 2022 Scoping Plan Model  
Comment:

Dear California Air Resources Board,

Fermata Energy LLC, d/ba/ Fermata Energy, is pleased to submit comments on the March 15th, 2022 workshop on the initial results from the 2022 scoping plan model.

Attached please find our comments.

Thank you,

Anna Bella Korbatov  
Senior Project Manager, Fermata Energy

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/27-sp22-modelresults-ws-VDJRMgNwU20FYgdz.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/27-sp22-modelresults-ws-VDJRMgNwU20FYgdz.pdf)

Original File Name: Fermata Energy Comments on Draft CARB Scoping Plan.docx.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 11:38:34

No Duplicates.



**Comment 25 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: David  
Last Name: Asti  
Email Address: David.Asti@sce.com  
Affiliation: Southern California Edison

Subject: SCE Comments on Initial Modeling Results Workshop  
Comment:

Hi,

I didn't get any confirmation of receipt, so I am resending.

David

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/28-sp22-modelresults-ws-AHMBZFM3WFQDZgZp.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/28-sp22-modelresults-ws-AHMBZFM3WFQDZgZp.pdf)

Original File Name: SCE\_Comments\_SPU\_IMR\_final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 11:57:01

No Duplicates.

**Comment 26 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Sydney

Last Name: Chamberlin

Email Address: s.j.chamberlin@tnc.org

Affiliation: The Nature Conservancy

Subject: Comments on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update Initial Modeling Results Workshop

Comment:

Please find attached comments from The Nature Conservancy on the Initial Modeling Results Workshop. Thank you for the opportunity to provide feedback.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/29-sp22-modelresults-ws-Wy9VPVY0BAGHbwZx.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/29-sp22-modelresults-ws-Wy9VPVY0BAGHbwZx.pdf)

Original File Name: TNC\_NWLScenarios.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 12:14:37

No Duplicates.

**Comment 27 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

This comment was posted then deleted because it was unrelated to the Workshop item or it was a duplicate.

**Comment 28 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Katharine

Last Name: Larson

Email Address: klarson@scppa.org

Affiliation: SCPPA

Subject: SCPPA Comments on Mar. 15 Workshop on Initial Modeling Results

Comment:

Please see attached comments.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/31-sp22-modelresults-ws-AnEAZQd2UXICZQRb.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/31-sp22-modelresults-ws-AnEAZQd2UXICZQRb.pdf)

Original File Name: SCPPA comments on 3.15.22 Preliminary GHG Modeling Results Workshop (final).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 13:45:26

No Duplicates.

**Comment 29 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Steven  
Last Name: Smith  
Email Address: steven.d.smith@p66.com  
Affiliation: Phillips 66

Subject: Phillips 66 Comments - 2022 Scoping Plan Update -Initial Modeling Results Workshop  
Comment:

Phillips 66 comments

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/32-sp22-modelresults-ws-VSVTPVI6Um0LYVA5.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/32-sp22-modelresults-ws-VSVTPVI6Um0LYVA5.pdf)

Original File Name: Phillips 66 Comments - CA Scoping Plan Initial Modeling Results 04-04-2022 .pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 15:07:07

No Duplicates.

**Comment 30 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Daniel

Last Name: Barad

Email Address: daniel.barad@sierraclub.org

Affiliation: Sierra Club California

Subject: Sierra Club California Comments on Scoping Plan - March 15, 2022 Workshop

Comment:

See attached. Thank you.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/33-sp22-modelresults-ws-B3QGQRgUHFxI1Ax.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/33-sp22-modelresults-ws-B3QGQRgUHFxI1Ax.pdf)

Original File Name: Sierra Club California Comments on Scoping Plan 3.15.2022 Workshop.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 15:16:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 31 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Virgil  
Last Name: Welch  
Email Address: virgil@caliberstrat.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: California Carbon Capture Coalition SP Comments  
Comment:

California Carbon Capture Coalition Scoping Plan Update 2022  
Initial Modeling Results Comments

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/34-sp22-modelresults-ws-B2RcO1ckUGECdw15.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/34-sp22-modelresults-ws-B2RcO1ckUGECdw15.pdf)

Original File Name: CARBSPINITIALMODELLINGCACARBONCAPTURECOALITION\_04\_4\_22.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 15:43:04

No Duplicates.

## **Comment 32 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Phil  
Last Name: Birkhahn  
Email Address: pbirkhahn@outlook.com  
Affiliation: Co-Chair Transportation Com San Diego350

Subject: ELECTRICITY TO MAKE HYDROGEN IS HIDDEN  
Comment:

ELECTRICITY TO  
MAKE HYDROGEN IS HIDDEN  
by Phil Birkhahn,  
Co-Chair Transportation Committee, San Diego 350  
E3 Slides 25 and  
26  
The two slides,  
E3 25 and 26, hide the massive environmental impact of hydrogen  
fuel cells. In  
addition to the fuel cell capacity, renewable electricity capacity  
of 55 GW is required for other electricity hogging steps before  
hydrogen is pumped into a fuel cell. It is shown in my edit of your graphic.  
Only one-third of  
the electricity used to make and deliver hydrogen is regenerated by  
the fuel cells. That  
low efficiency of just 33% must be carefully considered and all  
other options exhausted before the desperate move to hydrogen is  
made.  
Just saying the  
&ldquo;loads . . . . will be provided by off-grid renewables&rdquo;  
on E3 Slide 24 is a cop out.  
Vast amounts of land will be required for the solar panels  
and maybe some wind turbines.  
The huge demand  
for land for solar farms, is on the same order as the entire  
generating capacity of California today. Think three times more solar panels in the  
desert.  
Competition for  
the land will surely drive up the cost of all electricity used in  
California.  
Question: Why do columns for  
Alternatives in E3 Slides 25 and 26 show no fuel cell  
capacity. Other  
slides in the E3 presentation indicate substantial demand and use  
of hydrogen. Will of  
that hydrogen be burned?

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/35-sp22-modelresults-ws-AnJTewRaUWBXOFai.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/35-sp22-modelresults-ws-AnJTewRaUWBXOFai.pdf)

Original File Name: P. Birkhahn CARB Comment April 4 2022.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 15:42:25

No Duplicates.



**Comment 33 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Matt

Last Name: Haynie

Email Address: shayla@caliberstrat.com

Affiliation: POET

Subject: POET's Comments for 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results  
Comment:

Please find POET's comments attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/36-sp22-modelresults-ws-UTdWOVI9BzUFb1AP.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/36-sp22-modelresults-ws-UTdWOVI9BzUFb1AP.pdf)

Original File Name: Final 2022 Scoping Plan Update Initial Modeling Results March 15 2022 Workshop (1).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 15:37:57

No Duplicates.

**Comment 34 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Boccadoro

Email Address: mboccadoro@westcoastadvisors.com

Affiliation: Dairy Cares

Subject: Dairy Cares Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Update - Initial Modeling Results WS  
Comment:

Please see comments attached. Thank you!

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/39-sp22-modelresults-ws-AWUBZgdvU3IBflAP.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/39-sp22-modelresults-ws-AWUBZgdvU3IBflAP.pdf)

Original File Name: Dairy Cares Comments on SPU - Initial Modeling Results WS 220404 (00573690-2xBA8E1).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 16:27:48

No Duplicates.

**Comment 35 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Rebekah

Last Name: Weber

Email Address: rweber@ccof.org

Affiliation: CCOF

Subject: CCOF comment on Initial Modeling Results and Scoping Plan Update  
Comment:

Please find attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/40-sp22-modelresults-ws-WzhTNlM9WWwBWAlq.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/40-sp22-modelresults-ws-WzhTNlM9WWwBWAlq.pdf)

Original File Name: CCOF Comment Letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 16:47:13

No Duplicates.

**Comment 36 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Jim  
Last Name: Verburg  
Email Address: jverburg@wsa.org  
Affiliation: WSPA

Subject: Comments on California Air Resources Board's (CARB) 2022 Scoping Plan Update  
Comment:

Dear Ms. Sahota,

We are pleased to provide the attached comments on the Scoping Plan Scenarios developed by E3 that were presented in the March 15th, 2022 workshop.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Jim Verburg  
Senior Manager, Fuels  
Western States Petroleum Association

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/41-sp22-modelresults-ws-AWBUMF0DUjIGMgVa.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/41-sp22-modelresults-ws-AWBUMF0DUjIGMgVa.pdf)

Original File Name: AB 32 Comment Letter\_March 15 Public Workshop\_04042022.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 16:58:21

No Duplicates.

**Comment 37 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Steve

Last Name: Birdlebough

Email Address: scbaffirm@gmail.com

Affiliation: Transportation Land Use Coalition

Subject: Reduce Vulnerability to Climate Impacts

Comment:

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/42-sp22-modelresults-ws-AXIAZQF0AD9XMgJd.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/42-sp22-modelresults-ws-AXIAZQF0AD9XMgJd.pdf)

Original File Name: SCTLCLtr -CARB Scoping - Vulnerability 2022-04-04.PDF

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:02:01

No Duplicates.

**Comment 38 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Moises  
Last Name: Cisneros  
Email Address: moises.cisneros@sierraclub.org  
Affiliation: Sierra Club

Subject: Public Comments: 2022 Scoping Plan Update  
Comment:

On behalf of the Inland Deserts Working Group of community leaders, conservation and environmental justice groups, we thank you for taking the time to review our material.

If you have any questions, feel free to call or email us.

Respectfully,

Moises Cisneros  
213.324.7774

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/43-sp22-modelresults-ws-UjEBZgBzWGIRCFQn.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/43-sp22-modelresults-ws-UjEBZgBzWGIRCFQn.pdf)

Original File Name: CARB Scoping Plan Letter April4.docx-merged-compressed.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:04:34

No Duplicates.

**Comment 39 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Mandip

Last Name: Samra

Email Address: msamra@burbankca.gov

Affiliation: Joint Utilities Group (JUG)

Subject: JUG Comments on the Public Workshop: 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results W  
Comment:

The JUG is pleased to submit comments on the Public Workshop: 2022  
Scoping Plan Update - Initial Modeling Results Workshop.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/44-sp22-modelresults-ws-AWtUJ1E3U15VIFMj.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/44-sp22-modelresults-ws-AWtUJ1E3U15VIFMj.pdf)

Original File Name: JUG\_SPU\_Initial\_Modeling\_Results\_Comments Final\_4\_4\_22.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:06:37

No Duplicates.

**Comment 40 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Frank

Last Name: Harris

Email Address: fharris@cmua.org

Affiliation: California Municipal Utilities Associati

Subject: CMUA Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Update Preliminary Modeling Results  
Comment:

Please see CMUA's comments attached.

Best Regards,

Frank Harris

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/45-sp22-modelresults-ws-AmFSOQF1VGZSC1Mg.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/45-sp22-modelresults-ws-AmFSOQF1VGZSC1Mg.pdf)

Original File Name: CMUA Scoping Plan Comments 4.4.2022.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:06:35

No Duplicates.



**Comment 41 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Jessi

Last Name: Davis

Email Address: jdavis6@socalgas.com

Affiliation: SoCalGas

Subject: SoCalGas Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Update -Initial Modeling Results Workshop  
Comment:

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/46-sp22-modelresults-ws-BXYGb1AyADJQOgJl.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/46-sp22-modelresults-ws-BXYGb1AyADJQOgJl.pdf)

Original File Name: SoCalGas Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Update -Initial Modeling Results Workshop.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:12:01

No Duplicates.

**Comment 42 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Katelyn

Last Name: Roedner Sutter

Email Address: kroedner@edf.org

Affiliation: Environmental Defense Fund

Subject: Scoping Plan - initial modeling results - EDF comments

Comment:

Attached please find comments from Environmental Defense Fund on the initial modeling results of the 2022 Scoping Plan update.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/47-sp22-modelresults-ws-B3RdOFc5BCdSPQhm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/47-sp22-modelresults-ws-B3RdOFc5BCdSPQhm.pdf)

Original File Name: Scoping Plan - initial modeling results - EDF comments 4.4.22.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:17:00

No Duplicates.

**Comment 43 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Sam

Last Name: Wade

Email Address: sam@rngcoalition.com

Affiliation:

Subject: Comments on 3/15 Scoping Plan Workshop

Comment:

Please find our comments attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/48-sp22-modelresults-ws-ADJcaAEwB2BWYFJm.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/48-sp22-modelresults-ws-ADJcaAEwB2BWYFJm.pdf)

Original File Name: 220404 CARB 2022 GHG Scoping Plan Initial Modeling - RNG Coalition Comments.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:17:32

No Duplicates.

**Comment 44 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Asha

Last Name: Sharma

Email Address: asha@panna.org

Affiliation: Pesticide Action Network

Subject: Organic agriculture and pesticide reduction targets must be included in 2022 Scoping Plan  
Comment:

Thank you for the opportunity to comment. Please see the attached comment letter on behalf of the 38 signed organizations on the need to increase the rate of organic adoption, facilitate reductions in synthetic pesticide use, and provide support to impacted communities in order in the 2022 Scoping Plan.

Sincerely,  
Asha Sharma  
Organizing Co-Director  
Pesticide Action Network

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/49-sp22-modelresults-ws-UmACNF1uAGFQCQV2.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/49-sp22-modelresults-ws-UmACNF1uAGFQCQV2.pdf)

Original File Name: 2022 Scoping Plan Modeling Results Sign On Letter.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:20:23

No Duplicates.

**Comment 45 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Brian S.

Last Name: Biering

Email Address: bsb@eslawfirm.com

Affiliation: American Clean Power - California

Subject: ACP-California Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Update - Initial Modeling Results Workshop  
Comment:

Please see comments attached. Thank you!

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/50-sp22-modelresults-ws-UTBdOFcmVykAZVAX.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/50-sp22-modelresults-ws-UTBdOFcmVykAZVAX.pdf)

Original File Name: ACP-CA Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Update - Initial Modeling Results WS 220404 (00573699xBA8E1).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:27:56

No Duplicates.

**Comment 46 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Shana

Last Name: Lazerow

Email Address: slazerow@cbecal.org

Affiliation:

Subject: EJ and Equity - electric sector model alternatives that get to 0 MMT

Comment:

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/51-sp22-modelresults-ws-Wj9dMVMNVHRRNANc.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/51-sp22-modelresults-ws-Wj9dMVMNVHRRNANc.pdf)

Original File Name: EJ SC Scoping Plan Comments re Electric Sector modeling.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 16:53:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 47 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Susie

Last Name: Berlin

Email Address: berlin@susieberlinlaw.com

Affiliation: Northern California Power Agency

Subject: NCPA Comments on SPU Initial Modeling Results

Comment:

Northern California Power Agency Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan  
Update; Initial Modeling Results Workshop

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/52-sp22-modelresults-ws-WjRWM1cmVGycw1Q3.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/52-sp22-modelresults-ws-WjRWM1cmVGycw1Q3.pdf)

Original File Name: NCPA comments re SP initial modeling (04-04-22).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:51:38

No Duplicates.

**Comment 48 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Brian

Last Name: Nowicki

Email Address: bnowicki@biologicaldiversity.org

Affiliation: Center for Biological Diversity

Subject: Center for Biological Diversity comments on initial modeling results

Comment:

The Center for Biological Diversity appreciates this opportunity to provide input regarding the initial modeling results for the 2022 Scoping Plan Update presented at the March 15 workshop. Here we focus on instances where the modeling assumptions appear to be faulty or unsubstantiated, and we recommend ways to make the modeling analyses as robust, science-based, and transparent as possible.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/53-sp22-modelresults-ws-WmhcaFAOBGcKOFAP.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/53-sp22-modelresults-ws-WmhcaFAOBGcKOFAP.pdf)

Original File Name: 22 04 04 Center for Biological Diversity Comments on Initial Model Results.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 17:53:31

No Duplicates.



**Comment 49 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Steve  
Last Name: Birdlebough  
Email Address: scbaffirm@gmail.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: Scoping Plan Comments on Reducing Vulnerability to Climate Impacts  
Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/54-sp22-modelresults-ws-USJQNVQhBTpVMFQL.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/54-sp22-modelresults-ws-USJQNVQhBTpVMFQL.pdf)

Original File Name: SCTLCLtr -CARB Scoping - Vulnerability 2022-04-04.PDF

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 18:00:40

No Duplicates.

**Comment 50 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Susie

Last Name: Berlin

Email Address: berlin@susieberlinlaw.com

Affiliation: Golden State Power Cooperative

Subject: GSPC Comments on Initial Modeling Results

Comment:

Golden State Power Cooperative Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan  
Update; Initial Modeling Results Workshop

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/55-sp22-modelresults-ws-AmVVIFUkADABWAdk.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/55-sp22-modelresults-ws-AmVVIFUkADABWAdk.pdf)

Original File Name: GSPC comments re scoping plan initial modeling workshop (04-04-22).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 18:01:34

No Duplicates.

**Comment 51 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Julia

Last Name: May

Email Address: julia@cbeval.org

Affiliation:

Subject: CBE comments on Scoping Modeling - Refineries

Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/56-sp22-modelresults-ws-BmBXOAdoU2EGbAhr.zip](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/56-sp22-modelresults-ws-BmBXOAdoU2EGbAhr.zip)

Original File Name: finalcomments.pdf.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 18:11:38

No Duplicates.

**Comment 52 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Chuck

Last Name: Mills

Email Address: cmills@treepeople.org

Affiliation: TreePeople

Subject: TreePeople written comments on revised NWL Modeling Scenarios

Comment:

Resent due to error message from first effort.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/58-sp22-modelresults-ws-Uz0BcABtBAhWPQVq.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/58-sp22-modelresults-ws-Uz0BcABtBAhWPQVq.pdf)

Original File Name: NWL Modeling comments FINAL.docx.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 18:58:53

No Duplicates.

**Comment 53 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Emily  
Last Name: Turkel  
Email Address: emily.turkel@calpine.com  
Affiliation: Calpine Corporation

Subject: Comments of Calpine Corporation on the Initial Modeling Results Workshop  
Comment:

Please see the attached comments of Calpine Corporation on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update - Initial Modeling Results Workshop. Thank you for the opportunity to submit these comments.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/59-sp22-modelresults-ws-B2QBZl0wV3RRPlc5.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/59-sp22-modelresults-ws-B2QBZl0wV3RRPlc5.pdf)

Original File Name: Calpine Comments on Scoping Plan Initial Modeling Results Workshop.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 19:28:22

No Duplicates.

**Comment 54 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Floyd

Last Name: Vergara

Email Address: FVergara@cleanfuels.org

Affiliation: Clean Fuels Alliance America

Subject: Clean Fuels and CABA Comments on Scoping Plan Initial Modeling Results

Comment:

Please consider the attached comments. Thank you.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/60-sp22-modelresults-ws-UTJSOFYyUGIAaAlW.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/60-sp22-modelresults-ws-UTJSOFYyUGIAaAlW.pdf)

Original File Name: Clean Fuels\_CABA Comments CARB 2022 Scoping Plan Update (FINAL April 4 2022).pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 19:44:36

No Duplicates.

**Comment 55 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Arohi  
Last Name: Sharma  
Email Address: asharma@nrdc.org  
Affiliation: Natural Resources Defense Council

Subject: Public Comments to the 2022 Scoping Plan Update-Initial Modeling Results Workshop  
Comment:

Good Evening,

See attached for public comments from nine organizations, including the Natural Resources Defense Council, regarding CARB's 2022 Scoping Plan Initial Modeling Results Update. Please confirm that you received this safely. Thank you!

Cheers,  
Arohi Sharma

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/61-sp22-modelresults-ws-ATVddVBIVitXYwU1.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/61-sp22-modelresults-ws-ATVddVBIVitXYwU1.pdf)

Original File Name: 4.4.2022 Public Comments on CARBs NWL Modeling Results Update to 2022 Scoping Plan.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 20:41:41

No Duplicates.

**Comment 56 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Cindy  
Last Name: Parsons  
Email Address: cindy.parsons@ladwp.com  
Affiliation: LADWP

Subject: LADWP comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Initial Modeling Results workshop  
Comment:

See attached comments.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/62-sp22-modelresults-ws-UDxcO1UwVnICdAVa.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/62-sp22-modelresults-ws-UDxcO1UwVnICdAVa.pdf)

Original File Name: LADWP Comments 2022 Scoping Plan Modeling Results workshop (Final 04.04.22)-v2.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 20:46:44

No Duplicates.



**Comment 57 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Joy

Last Name: Alafia

Email Address: joy@westernpga.org

Affiliation:

Subject: 2022 CARB Scoping Plan - Propane

Comment:

Please find the attached document.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/63-sp22-modelresults-ws-VSJVIwFnV2UHXgZl.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/63-sp22-modelresults-ws-VSJVIwFnV2UHXgZl.pdf)

Original File Name: WPGA Comments RE 2022 Scoping Plan Building Decarbonization Workshop 4.04.2022\_Renewable Propane Final.doc.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 21:16:22

No Duplicates.

**Comment 58 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Robert

Last Name: Spiegel

Email Address: rspiegel@cmta.net

Affiliation: CA Manufacturers and Technology Assoc.

Subject: CA Business - Industry Coalition Comments: Initial Modeling Workshop

Comment:

Please see attached comments.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/64-sp22-modelresults-ws-VDdUM1QKBDUHdFIh.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/64-sp22-modelresults-ws-VDdUM1QKBDUHdFIh.pdf)

Original File Name: CA Business-Industry Coalition Comments - Scoping Plan Initial Modeling Results.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 21:20:15

No Duplicates.

**Comment 59 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Michael

Last Name: Wara

Email Address: mwara@stanford.edu

Affiliation: Stanford University

Subject: Thank you for considering our comment on the initial modeling results workshop

Comment:

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/65-sp22-modelresults-ws-BWQFcVMwUFxWI1Az.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/65-sp22-modelresults-ws-BWQFcVMwUFxWI1Az.pdf)

Original File Name: ARB Scoping Plan Modeling Workshop Stanford Comment.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 20:55:51

No Duplicates.

**Comment 60 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Neil

Last Name: Koehler

Email Address: neil.koehler@kbe-llc.com

Affiliation: Renewable Fuels Association

Subject: RFA comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Workshop

Comment:

RFA Scoping Plan comments

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/66-sp22-modelresults-ws-WihcPF09U18Lfgdk.zip](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/66-sp22-modelresults-ws-WihcPF09U18Lfgdk.zip)

Original File Name: RFA Scoping Plan Comments-04-04-22.zip

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 21:14:26

No Duplicates.

**Comment 61 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: John  
Last Name: O'Donnell  
Email Address: john@rondo.energy  
Affiliation: Rondo Energy

Subject: Rondo Energy Comments  
Comment:

See attached comments.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/67-sp22-modelresults-ws-ATNcaAY3UTYFMwUx.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/67-sp22-modelresults-ws-ATNcaAY3UTYFMwUx.pdf)

Original File Name: 220404 Rondo SP Modeling Results Comments.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 21:32:27

No Duplicates.

**Comment 62 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Nicole  
Last Name: Rice  
Email Address: nicolerice@cngvc.org  
Affiliation: CNGVC

Subject: CNGVC Comments  
Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/68-sp22-modelresults-ws-UDNSOIM1ByIDZIMM.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/68-sp22-modelresults-ws-UDNSOIM1ByIDZIMM.pdf)

Original File Name: CNGVC Modeling Results Comment Letter 040122.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 21:59:25

No Duplicates.

**Comment 63 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

This comment was posted then deleted because it was unrelated to the Workshop item or it was a duplicate.

**Comment 64 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Sarah  
Last Name: Deslauriers  
Email Address: sdeslauriers@carollo.com  
Affiliation: California Association of Sanitation Age

Subject: CASA Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan Update - March 15th Initial Modeling Results Workshop  
Comment:

Hello -  
The California Association of Sanitation Agencies (CASA) appreciates the opportunity to provide the attached comments on the Scoping Plan Update's Initial Modeling Results presented during the March 15th Public Workshop. CASA is an association of local agencies performing essential public services - cleaning wastewater to protect public health and the environment while advancing community resilience through the recovery of renewable resources (water, energy, fuel, biosolids, nutrients, etc.). Through these efforts we help create a clean and sustainable environment for Californians. Please contact me with any questions at sdeslauriers@carollo.com or at 925-705-6404. We look forward to collaboratively working with you on this critical effort.  
Sincerely,  
Sarah A. Deslauriers  
CASA Climate Change Program Manager

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/70-sp22-modelresults-ws-BmVSNQByUmACWwRn.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/70-sp22-modelresults-ws-BmVSNQByUmACWwRn.pdf)

Original File Name: CASA Comments on 2022 Scoping Plan-NWL Scenarios 040422\_FINAL.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-04 23:41:51

No Duplicates.



**Comment 65 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Sasan

Last Name: Saadat

Email Address: ssaadat@earthjustice.org

Affiliation:

Subject: Earthjustice and Leadership Counsel Comments on Modeling Workshop Comment:  
Comment:

Corrected comments resubmitted.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/71-sp22-modelresults-ws-Wm4HXgYzU19SJwNg.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/71-sp22-modelresults-ws-Wm4HXgYzU19SJwNg.pdf)

Original File Name: 4\_4 Scoping Plan Modeling Results Comments - Final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-05 11:38:08

No Duplicates.

**Comment 66 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Phil

Last Name: Birkhahn

Email Address: pbirkhahn@outlook.com

Affiliation: San Diego 350

Subject: BATTERY-POWERED LINE-HAUL and PASSENGER TRAINS

Comment:

Previous comments were submitted before the deadline. This version corrects the formatting.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/72-sp22-modelresults-ws-VTYAaQBsVGoKaVU7.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/72-sp22-modelresults-ws-VTYAaQBsVGoKaVU7.pdf)

Original File Name: Comment 27 for March 15 Workshop 2022 Scoping Plan Update Modeling Results.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-08 16:04:06

No Duplicates.

**Comment 67 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Sarah  
Last Name: Taheri  
Email Address: STaheri@sdge.com  
Affiliation:

Subject: SDG&E Comments on Scoping Plan Initial Modeling Scenarios Workshop  
Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/73-sp22-modelresults-ws-BnVdP1I0BAhWNQNc.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/73-sp22-modelresults-ws-BnVdP1I0BAhWNQNc.pdf)

Original File Name: SDG&E Comments on CARB Scoping Plan Initial Modeling Results Workshop\_04112022\_Final.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-12 08:19:30

No Duplicates.

**Comment 68 for Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) - 1st Workshop.**

First Name: Claire  
Last Name: Broome  
Email Address: cvbroome@gmail.com  
Affiliation: 350 Bay Area

Subject: Comments of 350 Bay Area on SP22-modelresults-ws  
Comment:

See attached.

Attachment: [www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/74-sp22-modelresults-ws-WmlSYVVkBwtWMgRl.pdf](http://www.arb.ca.gov/lists/com-attach/74-sp22-modelresults-ws-WmlSYVVkBwtWMgRl.pdf)

Original File Name: 350 Bay Area comments 2022 SP modelling.pdf

Date and Time Comment Was Submitted: 2022-04-14 14:02:14

No Duplicates.

**There are no comments posted to Public Workshop on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update – Initial Modeling Results Workshop (sp22-modelresults-ws) that were presented during the Workshop at this time.**